BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03323 2497

FAMILY LAW CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME 1

Nitya Duclos
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

January, 1990

Prepared with the assistance of Shereen Rowe

504
D83
1990
v.1

LAW LIBRARY

DEC 22 1989

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME 1

Nitya Duclos
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

January, 1990

Prepared with the assistance of Shereen Rowe

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma01ducl

FAMILY LAW

VOLUME I

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

A. The Social Framework

1. The Family as a Basic Social Unit

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents 1
Symes, "Property, Power and Dependence" 3
Eichler, Families in Canada Today: Recent Changes and Their Policy Consequences 15

2. The Family as Subjective Experience

Moore, "How Long Alone? The Duration of Female Lone Parenthood in Canada" 56
Gorlick, "Economic Stress, Social Support and Health/ Well-being of Low Income Female Single Parents" 56
Theilheimer, "The good, the bad, and the lonely --single parents talk about their experiences" 58
Rubin, Worlds of Pain: Life in the Working Class Family 62

3. The Family as an Economic Unit

Zaretsky, Capitalism, The Family and Personal Life 82
Olsen, "The Family and the Market: A Study of Ideology and Legal Reform" 100

B. The Justification for Legal Intervention

Weisbrod, "On the Expressive Functions of Family Law" 110
Eekelaar, Family Law and Social Policy 117
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family: For Baby Jane Doe" 125

C. The Constitutional Framework

Hogg, Constitutional Law of Canada, 2nd ed. 129

Derrickson v. Derrickson 136
NOTE: Paul v. Paul 145
Fudge, "The Public/Private Distinction: The Possibilities of and Limits to the Use of Charter Litigation To Further Feminist Struggles" 146

D. The Institutional Framework

1. Unified Family Court

Zuber Commission, Report of the Ontario Courts Inquiry 156
Hanna, "The Rush for Court Reform" 168

2. Mediation

Landau, "Mediation: An Option for Divorcing Families" 172
Woods, "Mediation: A Backlash to Women's Progress on Family Law Issues" 181

II CREATING THE FAMILY

A. The Significance of Marriage

Law Reform Commission of Canada, Bigamy 184
NOTE: Jones, "Sexual Equality, The Constitution and Indian Status: A Comment on s 12(1)(b) of the Indian Act" 186
Ziff, "Recent Developments in Canadian Law: Marriage and Divorce" 187
O'Donovan, "Legal Marriage - Who Needs It?" 189

B. Validity of Marriage

Hahlo, Nullity of Marriage in Canada 193

1. Opposite Sexes

Adams and Sullivan v. Howerton 195
Anderson v. Luoma 199
NOTE: Re Andrews and Minister of Health for Ontario 202
Leopold and King, "Compulsory Heterosexuality, Lesbians, and the Law: The Case for Constitutional Protection" 203
Duclos, "An Argument for Legal Recognition of Same Sex Marriage" 207

2. Consent

Thompson, "A Consideration of the Mental Capacity Provisions of the Marriage Act in View of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms and Webb v. Webb" 210
Asser v. Peermohamed 216
Singla v.Singla 221

C. Children

1. Adoption

Wilson, "A Summary of Substantive Issues in the Law of Adoption in Ontario: The Child and Family Services Act, 1984" 225
Pascall, "Adoption: Perspectives in Social Policy" 231
Landes and Posner, "The Economics of the Baby Shortage" 240
Ont. (A.G.) v. Nevins Prov. J. 245
Carasco, "Canadian Native Children: Have Child Welfare Laws Broken the Circle?" 251
Re Deborah E4-789 256
Mitchell v. Dennis and Dennis 261
McGillvray, "Transracial Adoption and the Status Indian Child" 265

2. Surrogacy

Field, Surrogate Motherhood: The Legal and Human Issues 273
Posner, "The Ethics and Economics of Enforcing Contracts of Surrogate Motherhood" 290
In the matter of Baby M 298
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on Human Artificial Reproduction and Related Matters 306

3. Reproduction

Re Eve 316
Glendon, Abortion and Divorce in Western Law 332
Garcia, "I Just Came Out Pregnant" 337
Mills, "Abortion Under Siege" 342
Gavigan, "Women, Law and Patriarchal Relations: Perspectives within the Sociology of Law" 345
Tremblay v. Daigle 350

III LEGAL REGULATION OF FAMILY lIFE

A. Parenting

1. Childcare

Schachter v. The Queen 354
Symes v. Canada 362

2. Children in Need of Protection

Thompson, "Taking Children and Facts Seriously: Evidence Law in Child Protection Hearings -- Part I" 370
Re W.P.D.W. 374
M. (R.E.D.) v. Dir. of Child Welfare 379
Re L.D.K. 386
Monture, "A Vicious Circle: Child Welfare and the First Nations" 392
Globe & Mail, "Children are Nightmarish Evidence of Alcohol Abuse by Mothers" 401
B.B. v. Director of Child & Family Services (Man.) 403
Grant, "Forced Obstetrical Intervention: A Charter Analysis" 407
Re R 421
C.A.S., Belleville v. L.T. and G.K. 427

B. Family Violence

1. Child Sexual Abuse

Silverman, Who Speaks for the Children? 430
Bisset-Johnson, "Domestic Violence: A Plethora of Problems and Precious Few Solutions" 436
Schlesinger, Sexual Abuse of Children in the 1980's 440
Sask. (Min. of Social Services) v. J.(A.) 447

2. Woman Abuse

Johnson and Chisholm, "Family Homicide" 454
McLeod, Battered But Not Beaten... Preventing Wife Battering in Canada 457
McGillivray, "Battered Women: Definition, Models and Prosecutorial Policy" 471
Globe & Mail, "Chances of charges increase for Ontario men who beat wives" 488